WHEN Eid AND Jumu'a COINCIDE



By: Shaikh Ibrahim Madani

when Eid and Jumu'a coincide

By: Shaikh Ibrahim Madani

If Eid falls on Jumu'a, the Eid salat will not make up for Jumu'a salat. We should remember that Jumu'a is *fard* [obligatory] and its compulsion is mentioned in the Quran, whereas Eid salat is sunnah or at the most *wājib* [necessary]. In that case, how can the sunnah of Eid cancel out something greater [an obligatory act] than itself? Some people who are of this opinion have misunderstood certain hadiths which are mentioned below.

عَنْ أَبِى هُرَيْرَةَ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ- صلى الله عليه وسلم -أَنَّهُ قَالَ قَدِ اجْتَمَعَ فِى يَوْمِكُمْ هَذَا عِيدَانِ فَمَنْ شَاءَ أَجْزَأَهُ مِنَ الْجُمُعَةِ وَإِنَّا مُجَمِّعُون (سنن أبى داود - ج 1 : ص 417)

It is narrated by Abū Huraira ﵁ that the Blessed Prophet ﷺ said,

> *Two Eids have coincided on this day. Whoever wishes Eid will suffice for him; but we will be praying Jumu'a.*

Let us take a look at a few things in this Hadith:

- Many eminent scholars of hadith criticize the chain of this Hadith. Hāfiz ibn Hajar, Dāraqutnī, and Imam Ahmad ibn Hanbal (rahimahumullah) all agree that this Hadith is with a broken chain.
- Even if this Hadith was unbroken [muttasil], it is a solitary chain of transmission [al-khabr al-wāhid] and all the scholars of hadith are unanimous that a solitary chain hadith cannot alter or void a ruling of the Qur'an.

• In the aforementioned Hadith, the Blessed Prophet ﷺ is not addressing the locals but rather villagers who lived in the outskirts of Madina.

Imam Shāfi'ī (ra) narrated from 'Umar ibn 'Abd al-'Azīz (ra),

عن عمر بن عبد العزيز رضي الله عنه قال : اجتمع عيدان على عهد النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم فقال من أحب أن يجلس من أهل العالية فليجلس في غير حرج. (مسند الشافعي- ج 1: ص 77)

Two Eids coincided in the time of the Blessed Prophet ﷺ. The Blessed Prophet ﷺ announced, "Whoever, from amongst the people of the outskirt areas, wishes to stay [for Jumu'a] may stay."

The aforementioned statement clarifies that the Blessed Prophet ﷺ was addressing the people from the outskirt areas upon whom Jumu'a was not compulsory.

In fact, Jumu'a was not even held in the villages outside of Madina. Some narrators have deleted mention of the 'ahl-'āliya' (villagers of Awaali, a village in the outskirts of Madina) though other narrators did mention it which makes the matter plainly clear.

In the above Hadith, the words are innā Mujammi'ūn (we will pray Jumu'a). "We" is referring to the people of Madina who prayed their Jumu'a with the Blessed Prophet ﷺ.

This is why when two Eids coincided in the caliphate of ''Uthmān ؓ he announced,

قَالَ أَبُو عُبَيْدٍ ثُمَّ شَهِدْتُ الْعِيدَ مَعَ عُثْمَانَ بْنِ عَفَّانَ فَجَاءَ فَصَلَّى ثُمَّ انْصَرَفَ فَخَطَبَ وَقَالَ إِنَّهُ قَدْ اجْتَمَعَ لَكُمْ فِي يَوْمِكُمْ هَذَا عِيدَانِ فَمَنْ أَحَبَّ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْعَالِيَةِ أَنْ يَنْتَظِرَ الْجُمُعَةَ فَلْيَنْتَظِرْهَا وَمَنْ أَحَبَّ أَنْ يَرْجِعَ فَقَدْ أَذِنْتُ لَهُ. (موطأ مالك - ج 2 : ص 249)

Today, two Eids have coincided; those villagers who wish to wait for Jumu'a may wait, but if someone wants to return, I will not stop him.

‘Uthmān ﵁ is repeating what the Blessed Prophet ﷺ said previously that the villagers are allowed to return to their villages in the outskirts of Madina. We learn from this that Jumu‘a was compulsory upon the people of Madina and the concession [not to pray Jumu‘a] was only for those who lived outside of Madina.

Another point to remember is that there is no evidence that the Blessed Prophet ﷺ and the righteous caliphs ever cancelled Jumu‘a salat because of Eid.

In the presence of numerous sahāba ﵃, ‘Uthmān ﵁ made an announcement in which he mentioned that only the people from the outskirts are allowed to not attend Jumu‘a. If this order applied to everyone, then the sahāba ﵃ would have definitely objected to ‘Uthmān’s ﵁ announcement that ‘why is he only permitting the people of outskirt areas when this concession applies to everyone.’

Imam shaafi (ra) says in kitaabul Umm :

قال الشَّافِعِيُّ وإذا كان يَوْمُ الْفِطْرِ يوم الْجُمُعَةِ صلى الْإِمَامُ الْعِيدَ حين تَحِلُّ الصَّلَاةُ ثُمَّ أَذِنَ لِمَنْ حَضَرَهُ من غَيْرِ أَهْلِ الْمِصْرِ في أَنْ يَنْصَرِفُوا إنْ شاؤوا إلَى أَهْلِيهِمْ وَلَا يَعُودُونَ إلَى الْجُمُعَةِ وَالِاخْتِيَارُ لهم أَنْ يُقِيمُوا حتى يَجْمَعُوا أو يَعُودُوا بَعْدَ انْصِرَافِهِمْ إنْ قَدَرُوا حتى يَجْمَعُوا وَإِنْ لم يَفْعَلُوا فَلَا حَرَجَ إنْ شَاءَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى) قال الشَّافِعِيُّ (وَلَا يَجُوزُ هذا لِأَحَدٍ من أَهْلِ الْمِصْرِ أَنْ يُدْعَوْا أَنْ يَجْمَعُوا إلَّا من عُذْرٍ يَجُوزُ لهم بِهِ تَرْكُ الْجُمُعَةِ وَإِنْ كان يوم عِيدٍ) قال الشَّافِعِيُّ (وَهَكَذَا إنْ كان يوم الْأَضْحَى لَا يَخْتَلِفُ إذَا كان بِبَلَدٍ يَجْمَعُ فيه الْجُمُعَةَ ويصلى الْعِيدَ .(الأم - ج 1 : ص 239)

“If Eid occurs on the day of Jumu‘a, the imam will lead the Eid salat on the normal Eid salat time. He will then give permission to those who are present amongst the outsiders [those who do not live in the city] to return, if they wish, to their homes without returning for Jumu‘a. It is at their discretion whether they wish to stay in the city [and pray Jumu‘a] or go home and return for Jumu‘a; though, they are not required to return for Jumu‘a. Though, none of the city dwellers are permitted to miss Jumu‘a unless they have a valid reason which would have normally excused them from attending Jumu‘a. The same ruling applies for Eid al-Aḍḥā in a city in which Jumu‘a and Eid are held.”

عن النعمان بن بشير قال : كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم يقرأ في الجمعة والعيد ب سبح اسم ربك الأعلى وهل أتاك حديث الغاشية فإذا اجتمع الجمعة والعيدان في يوم قرأ بهما. (سنن النسائي الكبرى - ج 1 : ص 547)

Nuʿmān ibn Bashīr ﷺ narrates that the Blessed Prophet ﷺ recited Sūrat al-Aʿlā and Sūrat al- Ghāshia on Jumuʿa and Eid. And if Jumuʿa and Eid came on the same day, he recited both these suras in both these salat.

This Hadith clearly states that the Blessed Prophet ﷺ prayed both Jumuʿa and Eid when they fell on the same day.